

**PROMOTION OF FEMALE CIVIL SERVANTS IN
THAILAND :
success and limitations**

**Hiroko Hashimoto
Social Affairs Officer
United Nations
Economic Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific
THAILAND**

I. Introduction

In Thailand, the total number of government employees, including civil servants and workers at government enterprises, such as the Electricity Generating Authority of Thailand (EGAT) and the Telephone Organization of Thailand (TOT), has gradually decreased from 1.855 million in 1985 to 1.813 million in 1992¹. The latter was 5.5% of the total labour force (33.199 million) and 17.9%² of total employees (10.120 million) in Thailand³. On the contrary, the number of private sector employees has increased rapidly from 6.468 million to 8.307 million during the same period⁴.

The number of civil servants, excluding government enterprise workers, police officers, teachers, provincial officers, etc., was 303,932 in 1990 and 304,307 in 1992, showing a marginal increase in the number of public servants despite the decrease of the total number of government employees. The number was more than in Japan (231,693 in 1991) where the national population is about twice of that of Thailand. The main reason why the number of civil servants per capita in Thailand is roughly three times that of Japan is that the public administration system in

Japan is relatively more decentralized⁵ than in Thailand. Another factor may be that civil servants in Thailand include medical professionals at national hospitals, while their counterparts in Japan are classified in a different category. In fact, the number of staff working with the Ministry of Public Health in Thailand comprises more than 35% of all civil servants and female staff working with the Ministry comprise more than half of the total female civil servants (Table 9).

Table 9. Number of Civil Servants in Thailand by Ministry and Sex FY 1985 and 1990

Ministry	1985					1990				
	Total	Male		Female		Total	Male		Female	
	No.	No.	%	No.	%	No.	No.	%	No.	%
Office of the Prime Minister	7719	4006	51.9	3713	48.1	9300	4594	49.4	4706	50.6
Ministry of Finance	18698	10730	57.4	7968	42.6	21162	10539	49.8	10623	50.2
Ministry of Foreign Affairs	1186	715	60.3	471	39.7	1295	728	56.2	567	43.8
Ministry of Agriculture and Cooperatives	43979	32068	72.9	11911	27.1	47640	34554	72.5	13086	27.5
Ministry of Transport and Communication	10354	7535	72.8	2720	26.2	15012	9996	66.6	5016	33.4
Ministry of Commerce	3216	1483	46.1	1733	53.9	3940	1641	41.6	2299	58.4
Ministry of Interior	52808	37054	70.2	15754	29.8	61327	41537	67.7	19790	32.3
Ministry of Justice	3967	1598	40.3	2378	59.7	5306	1749	33.0	3557	67.0
Ministry of Science, Technology and Energy	1784	920	51.6	864	48.4	18733	6375	34.0	12358	66.0
Ministry of Education	461379	194896	42.2	266483	57.8	109352	264	0.2	80478	73.6
Ministry of Public Health	70847	19622	27.7	51225	72.3	4624	2811	60.8	1813	39.2
Ministry of Industry	3758	2388	63.5	1370	36.5	2537	1261	49.7	1276	50.3
Ministry of University Affairs	33363	11703	35.1	21660	64.9	293	88	30.0	205	70.0
Independent Public Agencies	3123	1453	46.5	1670	53.5	3411	1517	44.5	1894	55.5
Total	716181	326171	45.5	390019	54.5	303932	146264	48.1	157668	51.9
Total (without Ministries of Education and University Affairs)	221439	119572	54.0	101876	46.0	194287	117302	60.4	76985	39.6

Source : Office of the Civil Service Commission

In Thailand, in 1992, there were 157,729 women out of the total of 304,037 civil servants equivalent to 51.8%. Among government enterprise employees, women represented 30% in 1985. The percentage has not increased as most of the available occupations in the government enterprises are in technology and engineering related fields, which more male students have studied than female students.

The female ratio among civil servants in Japan was only 15.3 percent in 1991, which included the 1.2 percent increase since 1985⁶. Increasing rate of female ratio among public servants in Thailand has been more acute than that of Japan. Thailand has been considerably successful in utilizing woman power in civilservice, coming second to the Philippines where the female ratio in civil service is the highest in this region (52.28% in 1980 and 52.51% in 1991⁷). The high female ratio among public servants in Thailand could be the direct reflection of the higher percentage of female economically active population in the country. The female economically active population in Thailand has been the highest among the countries in the Asian and Pacific region (52.8% in 1990) ; that of the Philippines was 47.0 in 1991.

In fact, various surveys and studies have revealed that Thailand is one of the most advanced countries among free market economies in this region with regard to the integration of woman power into decision making in both the public and private sectors, following to the Philippines and Australia.

This paper will examine the status of female civil servants with special reference women at the managerial level, discuss and try to identify the factors hindering them from promotion and finally propose measures to be taken by the Government to promote women's advancement in public administration in Thailand.

To give a clearer understanding of the situation of female civil servants in Thailand, the status of their counterparts in Japan will be compared whenever appropriate. Detailed data, particularly in English,

are not easily available in Thailand, similar to other developing countries. Furthermore, sex disaggregated data are neither available nor accessible in Thailand⁸. Therefore, this paper relied mostly on sex disaggregated data kindly provided by Dr. Dhipavadee Meksawan, Deputy Secretary, office of the Civil Service Commission, Government of Thailand. She collected the data during her preparations for her forthcoming paper: Baseline study on women in human resource development in Thailand. In this connection, special appreciation is expressed for the cooperation with the author in the preparation of this paper.

II. Situation of women in civil service

1. Overview

Table 1 indicates the number of civil servants by level, sex and age as of 1 October 1992 in Thailand. At a glance, it is apparent that the distribution of female civil servants by level in Thailand shows a tendency that has been universally and historically perpetuated, regardless of differences in political and economic systems, "the lower the level, the more females". Furthermore, it also shows another universal tendency, "the younger their age, the more females". Unfortunately, sex disaggregated data on newly recruited staff is not available from the Commission of Civil Service as all recruitment is processed by individual Ministries. However, as most of the newly recruited staff have been posted at level 3 or lower levels, it could be assumed that more young women have been recruited into the civil than young men from table 1. However, table 1 also shows that those women have stayed at the same level considerably longer than their male colleagues with few opportunities for promotion to higher levels. Chapter III will further elaborate this situation.

There is a diverse distribution of female civil servants among Ministries (Table 9). While the Ministries of Agriculture, of Transport-

Table 1. Number of civil servants by level, sex and age as of 1 October 1992

Age-cluster	Total	C-1		C-2		C-3		C-4		C-5		C-6		C-7		C-8		C-9		C-10		C-11	
		M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F
Total	304047	8222	13630	15273	21785	37937	56149	30503	29934	31022	24792	14387	8413	6400	2474	1914	499	365	45	275	18	20	—
%		37.6	62.4	29.9	70.1	40.3	59.7	50.5	49.5	55.6	44.4	63.1	36.9	72.1	27.9	80.0	20.0	89.0	11.0	93.9	6.1	100.0	0
18-24	13874	1410	3698	2358	4520	184	1704	53	31	2	3	—	—	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
25-29	59454	4025	7298	6799	10838	6738	17426	1991	4081	171	84	2	—	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
30-34	70499	2053	2370	4308	5347	13133	18524	8045	8348	3310	4866	125	67	2	—	—	1	—	—	—	—	—	—
35-39	58022	505	273	1200	813	7990	10181	8774	7356	9167	8188	1860	1385	244	88	4	3	—	1	—	—	—	—
40-44	39032	138	59	352	187	3924	4159	4945	4646	7153	5341	3626	2901	989	476	80	42	12	1	—	1	—	—
45-49	29004	63	16	140	62	2854	2739	3399	3300	5010	3499	3408	1900	1522	624	298	95	34	9	21	1	—	—
50-54	21119	20	5	77	13	2252	1016	2363	1575	3957	1854	3176	1393	1865	713	554	148	83	6	45	4	—	—
55	2824	2	—	9	2	184	98	281	151	511	222	535	198	344	159	154	31	25	3	15	—	—	—
56	2393	1	—	6	—	164	81	194	112	429	185	381	170	315	124	155	30	26	4	15	—	1	—
57	1732	—	—	3	—	123	61	149	85	288	139	290	101	240	74	103	20	29	2	24	—	1	—
58	1568	—	—	4	—	109	51	95	79	259	113	271	78	234	64	135	19	32	1	20	1	3	—
59	1344	1	—	2	—	74	41	71	57	247	88	234	66	208	52	120	22	27	6	25	2	1	—
60 & above	3082	4	1	15	3	208	68	143	113	518	210	479	154	435	100	311	78	97	12	110	9	14	—

Source: Civil Service Commission, Thailand

tation, of Interior and of Industry are male dominated, the majority of staff at the Ministries of Public Health and of Education are female. Between 1985 and 1990, the male staff concentration in the above-mentioned four Ministries gradually increased, while female staff concentration in the Ministry of Public Health also increased by 1.3%. The distribution of male and female staff among Ministries has reflected similar tendencies in gender distribution of fields majored by students at universities and colleges. This will be discussed later. The office administering and managing national school teachers and teaching staff at national universities and colleges was transferred from the jurisdiction of the Civil Service Commission in the late 1980s. The figures in 1985 and 1990 for those two Ministries in table 9, are, therefore, not comparable as the 1985 figures included all officers of the Ministries of Education and University Affairs and the 1991 figures included only administrative officers of those Ministries. The total number of civil servants in 1985 and 1990, are, thus, only comparable by excluding the numbers of officers who worked with both Ministries. The figures were 221,439 (M119,563 ; F 101,876) in 1985 and 284,906 (M 139,801 ; F 145,105) in 1991 and clearly show the increase of female ratio among civil servants (excluding civil servants at two Ministries), from 46% to 51%. In any case, both Ministries have always been dominated by female. Furthermore, the number of officers of the Ministry of Education includes over 43,000 school teachers which comprise more than 60% of civil servants and most of which are females. Therefore, when the number excluding national school teachers and teaching staff at national universities and colleges is not available in 1991, comparison of the number of civil servants in 1985 and 1991 excluding the number of two Ministries' staff could be more rational.

2. Educational background

In 1984, 132,046 people took civil service examination. As the num-

ber of university graduates in 1984 was 54,272, it could be concluded that about 24% of graduates from universities and colleges took the examination for the civil service, disregarding people who had graduated from institutions in earlier years and took the examination in 1984. As sex disaggregated data on educational attainment of civil servants are not available, educational background of civil servants will be discussed referring to the data on the fields majored by university and college graduates in 1992 as shown in table 3 and 3a. While fields majored by male graduates concentrate on law, engineering and agriculture, more female students majored in humanities, business administration, home economics, and medical science and health areas than male students. It should be noted that the number of female students who studied business administration was nearly 2.5 times that of male students.

It should also be emphasized that females comprise 53.6% of total graduates who received bachelor's degrees (B.A.) and other undergraduate diplomas. However, among students who acquired graduate degrees such as Masters (M.A.) and Doctorates (Ph. D), 50.8% were male students. Comparing undergraduate degrees, the difference between male and female students who received graduate degrees is not significant.

In comparison with the situation of students at higher educational institutions in Thailand, that in Japan is depressing, as shown in table 4. Despite an 8% increase, female students represented only 30% of total students at higher educational institutions in 1992. Furthermore, fields more often studied by female students, such as humanities, home economics and the arts, indicate extremely stereo-typed sex roles, although some improvement has been achieved since 1980, such as about 4% increase of female students majoring in science or engineering and more than twice of increase in the percentage of female students majoring in social sciences and agriculture. Comparison with the number of female students in Thailand, the lower representation of Japanese female students in fields such as social sciences, science and engineering might have

caused the female labour force participation rate in Japan to be lower and the wage gap between male and female employees in Japan wider than that in other countries in this region.

3. Scholarships

Table 6 indicates sex, field of study and educational level of students studying abroad (SSA) under the Government of Thailand scholarship scheme. Table 5 shows the same components of government officials studying abroad (GOS). Students who have studied abroad under the government scholarship scheme do not require to return the scholarship to the government, upon completion of the study period, if they work with the Government for more than three times the number of years which they received the scholarship. If they study in Thailand with a government scholarship, they have to work with the government for more than two times the period that they received the scholarship in order to avoid returning the scholarship. Similar formula are applied to the government officials.

Therefore, students studying with government scholarships could be considered as prospective government officers. Women composed 54.1% of the total GOS and 42.2% of the total SSA. The fields studied by SSA cover mostly natural sciences and technologies, which, with the inclusion of agriculture, are studied by 80.3% of the total number of SSA; natural sciences and technologies without agriculture are studied by 77.4% of the total number of SSA. In comparison, 40.4% of the total number of GOS studied natural science and technology related fields, including agriculture; and 30.0% studied the fields without agriculture. The main factor causing the above results could be that 45% of male SSA study engineering, while 42.8% of female GOS study social sciences, medicine and health science and education. Men are the majority among students studying engineering and physics regardless of their status (GOS or SSA), and educational levels. Although GOS female students greatly outnumber

male counterparts in social sciences, only four SSA male students are

Table 6. Government Scholarships of Students Studying Abroad Classified by Gender, Field of Study and Educational Level in September 1993

Field of Study	Total	Subtotal				Doctor			Master			Bachelor		
		F	M	%F	%inF	F	M	%F	F	M	%F	F	M	%F
Agriculture	23	16	7	69.6	4.8	11	6	64.7	5	1	83.3	0	0	0.0
Architecture	3	1	2	33.3	0.3	0	0		1	0	100.0	0	2	0.0
Biological Science	54	30	24	55.6	9.0	13	10	56.5	13	9	59.1	4	5	44.4
Business Administration	10	5	5	50.0	1.5	1	1	50.0	4	4	50.0	0	0	
Chemistry	39	25	14	64.1	7.5	12	4	75.0	12	10	54.6	1	0	100.0
Computer Science	98	35	64	35.7	10.5	10	10	50.0	14	26	35.0	11	27	29.0
Economics	34	22	12	64.7	6.6	1	1	50.0	5	6	45.5	16	5	76.2
Education	5	3	2	60.0	0.9	0	1	0.0	1	1	50.0	2	0	100.0
Engineering	301	95	206	31.6	28.4	26	45	36.6	35	79	30.7	34	82	9.3
Food Science	9	7	2	77.8	2.1	1	1	50.0	6	0	100.0	0	1	0.0
Language and Literature	8	4	4	50.0	1.2	0	1	0.0	1	3	25.0	3	0	100.0
Law	12	2	10	16.7	0	3	0.0	2	7	22.2	0	0		
Mass Communication	1	1	0	100.0	0.3	0	0		1	0	100.0	0	0	
Material Science	67	39	28	58.2	11.6	8	12	40.0	26	11	70.3	5	5	50.0
Mathematics	11	1	10	9.9	0.3	0	2	0.0	0	1	0.0	1	3	25.0
Medicine & Health Science	52	26	26	50.0	7.8	9	8	52.9	15	11	57.7	2	7	22.2
Pharmacy	16	9	7	56.3	2.7	4	2	66.7	5	5	50.0	0	0	
Physics	32	7	25	21.9	2.1	3	10	23.1	1	15	6.3	3	0	100.0
Political Science	10	5	5	50.0	1.5	0	1	0.0	3	0	100.0	2	4	33.3
Psychology	3	1	2	33.3	0.3	0	1	0.0	1	1	50.0	0	0	
Public Administration	1	1	0	100.0	0.3	0	0		1	0	100.0	0	0	
Social Science	4	0	4	0.0	0.0	0	4	0.0	0	0		0	0	
Total	793	335	358	42.2	100	99	123	44.6	152	194	43.9	84	141	37.3

Source: Office of the Civil Service Commission, Education and Training Abroad Division

studying social science with no female counterpart. From the data on scholarships, explicit discrimination against women was not found. Women have been treated almost equally in obtaining scholarships and studying abroad.

4. Salaries and the "brain drain"

In Thailand, 35% of the national budget went in salaries for civil servants in 1985. The figure has gradually increased to 37% in 1992, related to the increase in their number. Nevertheless, civil servants in Thailand have suffered from lower salaries in comparison with their counterparts, who hold similar educational background, in the private sector. Furthermore, wage differences between the public sector and the private sector has widened despite the various measures that have been taken by the former Anand cabinet and other leaders of the nation.

There have been complaints that the salaries and wages paid to government officials are below the cost of living by approximately 20%⁹. Salary increases, in the public sector, has apparently failed to catch up with the increasing cost of living in the country, which has closely followed the most rapid economic growth of South East Asian Countries --two digits during 1988-1990 --. The salary levels for public servants, which has been lagging behind that of the private sectors, has become less attractive to new graduates, in particular, university and post secondary education institution graduates with science and technology related degrees. They could enjoy numerous job opportunities with considerably more attractive salary and benefits in the private sector.

Furthermore, an increasing number of competent civil servants, particularly male officers have left the Government for the private sector. In general, female civil servants have participated less in the "brain drain" because of various reasons including social norms and their tendency to stay with same organizations, in comparison with their male counterparts. The following are the main factors that cause female civil servants to refrain from pursuing alternative job opportunities in the private sector :

- Better salary and benefits are not essential to female civil servants as they often come from relatively affluent families¹⁰ and frequently are not main bread winners in the household.
- Furthermore, under the regulations of the public sector, both men

and women receive the same salary when they are at same level. (Although obvious discrimination against women regarding promotion exists as further elaborated in a later chapter.) However, in the private sector, companies could easily discriminate against women regarding salary and benefits. Thailand has not introduced an equal employment law yet¹¹.

----Longer working hours in the private sector : Official working for government officers are from Monday to Friday in Thailand. However, Saturday (a half day or full day) is still part of the working week in most of private companies in the country. According to the Labour Force Survey in 1991, in municipal areas in Thailand, 60.3% of private employees worked 40-49 hours/week and 35.4% of them 50 hours or more/week, while 50.6% of government employees worked 35-39 hours/week and 37.0% of them worked 40-49 hours/week. Among companies with foreign investments, those jointly owned by Western investors mostly introduced the five working day system, While companies jointly owned by Asian investors such as Japanese still consider a half day of Saturday as a working day. Besides issues relating to the number of working days per week, private sector workers, at the senior level in particular, are required to continue working after the normal working hours whenever necessary. However, this situation or condition is not easily acceptable to female workers, who are usually responsible for domestic affairs and child rearing. Although middle or upper class families in Thailand engage house maids and nannies without exception, wives and mothers still take greater responsibilities for such matters, while husbands and fathers take almost no responsibilities for them.

----Various discriminations against women, including sexual harassment, are more common and perpetuated in the private sector

than in the public sector.

-----Work in the private sector tends to be more money and materialism oriented: civil servants work for the public. More females have shown that they are willing to pursue this objective.

-----Job security and the pension scheme for civil servants are considerably better than in the private sector.

The above factors have facilitated increasing the ratio of female civil servants in Thailand, particularly at the managerial and executive level.

5. Women at the managerial level

According to Thailand's Labour Force Surveys, ratio of female officers at the administrative level among all government employees has increased from 18% in 1973 to 29.0% in 1985 and dropped to 25.9% in 1989 and further decreased to 22.8% in 1991 (table 7). An interesting finding is that there is a distinctive difference between municipal areas and non-municipal areas in gender composition of administrative level government employees as indicated by the breakdown by areas in 1989 and 1991 in the table.

Managerial level in the civil service in Thailand are considered level 7 and above. In 1985 (table 8), the percentage of females among civil servants at level 7 and above was 17.8, after excluding the number of officers at the two Ministries of Education and of University Affairs¹². The percentage increased to 25.2 in 1991. (This figure includes administrative staff of the Ministries of Education and of University Affairs. As show in table 9, in 1990, the total number of administrative staff of both Ministries comprise 6% of all civil servants. Senior officers at the level 7 and above at both Ministries may have been negligible in 1985.)

According to table 8, in 1985, among the various Ministries, the Ministry of Interior had the lowest (5%) of female officers at level 7 and above, followed by the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, the Ministry of Transport and Communications with the percentages of 6 and 7, respec-

tively. The female ratio among officers at level 7 and above are relatively larger at the Ministries of Public Health ; Science ; Technology and Energy ; and Commerce. This difference indicates that women have more opportunities for promotion at the Ministries that have more professional posts rather than Ministries that have more administrative posts.

Table 10 shows the gender composition at level 9 and above by Ministries as of 1993. The appointment of a female officer to level 11 was the first in Thailand and the appointment of a female governor in 1993 was also a first in Thailand's history. Female representation among senior executive officers at level 9 and above was 8.4% in 1990, 9.5% in 1992 and 9.3% in 1993. The nearly 1% increase over several years

Table 2. Number of National Civil Servants in Japan by level and sex

Level	Year							
	1985				1991			
	Male	Female	% of F	Total	Male	Female	% of F	Total
1	18930	4378	23.1	23308	14692	5286	36.0	19978
2	20770	4194	20.2	24964	20207	5213	25.8	25420
3	33670	11567	34.4	45237	35634	9773	27.4	45407
4	38006	8176	21.5	46182	33980	7156	21.1	41136
5	19796	3302	16.7	23098	20496	3231	15.8	23727
6	33316	2221	6.7	35537	29894	3673	12.3	33567
7	13974	181	1.3	14155	16550	798	4.8	17348
8	16576	167	1.0	16743	17677	259	1.5	17936
9	3476	17	0.5	3493	3801	31	0.8	3832
10	1625	9	0.6	1634	1906	13	0.7	1919
11	1375	10	0.7	1385	1408	15	1.1	1438
Total	201514	34222	17.0	235736	196245	35448	18.1	231708

Source : National Personnel Authority, "Report on general category of national civil servants."

Table 7. Government officers at administrative level by sex

Year	Number		%F	Total
	Male	Female		
1975	47800	6400	11.8	54200
1980	82900	11500	12.2	94400
1985	119400	48800	29.0	168200
1989 (Municipal area)	60700	35500	36.9	96200
(Non-Municipal area)	62500	7500	10.7	70000
Total	123200	43000	25.9	166200
1991 (Municipal area)	63200	33200	34.4	96400
(Non-municipal area)	83600	8100	8.8	91700
Total	146800	41300	22.0	188100

Source: Report of Labor Force Survey, Round1 (February 1985 and 1991, National Statistical Office, Office of the Prime Minister.

was the result of government endeavors to respond to international and domestic pressure regarding the advancement of the status of Thai women. It indicates a promising and bright perspective for the advancement of women in the civil service in Thailand. Four Ministries, namely: the Prime Minister's Office; Finance; Commerce; Science and Technology, have successfully promoted female officers to senior executive levels. However, those four do not correspond to either the Ministries have higher female staff representation or the Ministries that have higher percentages of female officers at level 7 and above than other Ministries. Several reasons could be responsible: the appointments to Level 9 and above are usually political in nature and outside candidates have been more often appointed to such posts rather than promoting officers from inside the Ministry; female officers in the Ministries, like Public Health and Science and Technology, are mostly experts in their fields rather than administrators and are rarely promoted to such senior executive levels.

Table 8. Number of Civil Service Officer at Level 7 and Above

Ministry	Total	Male	Female	%Female
Total	15133	10501	4632	30.6
Office the Prime Minister	567	413	154	27.2
Ministry of Finance	636	544	92	14.5
Ministry of Foreign Affairs	187	176	11	5.9
Ministry of Agriculture and Cooperatives	1612	1416	196	12.2
Ministry of Transport and Communication	396	368	28	7.1
Ministry of Commerce	263	200	63	24.0
Ministry of Interior	1897	1799	98	5.2
Ministry of Justice	79	71	8	10.1
Ministry of Science, Technology and Energy	141	93	48	34.0
Ministry of Education	2674	1558	1116	41.7
Ministry of Public Health	1807	1161	646	35.7
Ministry of Industry	227	191	36	15.9
Ministry of University Affairs	4537	2530	2107	46.4
Independent Public Agencies	110	81	29	26.4

Independent Public Agencies include the Royal Instiyute, the Bureau of the Royal Household, the Office of His Majesty's Principal Private Secretary, the Office of the Auditor-General of Thailand, the secretariat of the National Assembly.

Sourrde: Report Survey of Government Officers 1985, Personnel Policies and Standards Division, Office of the Civil Service Commission.

In the Philippines, which has been the most successful country in this region, along with Australia, regarding the promotion of the status of women to executive levels, female government employees at the executive level were 28.8% in 1990 and female percentage among executive civil servants were 24.9¹³. In both cases the female ratio was higher than in Thailand.

Japan is at the extreme opposite pole to the Philippines, regarding female ratio among executive levels in the public sector. Female officers at level 8 and above was 0.9% in 1985¹⁴ and increased to 1.3% in 1991 (table 2). In Japan, civil servant who are Deputy Ministers in charge of

Table 10. Senior Executive Classified by Ministry, Gender and Grade level FY 1993

Ministry	Grade Level								
	9		10		11		Total		
	Male	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female	% Female
Prime Minister's Office	13	4	33	6	10	0	56	10	15.2
Finance	14	5	10	0	1	0	25	5	16.7
Foreign Affairs	15	2	10	2	1	0	26	4	13.3
Agriculture	31	0	15	0	1	0	47	0	0.0
Transportation	17	1	10	1	1	0	28	2	6.7
Commerce	13	3	8	2	1	0	22	5	18.5
Interior	26	4	87	2	1	0	114	6	5.0
Justice	6	0	6	0	1	0	11	0	0.0
Education	33	3	15	1	1	0	49	4	7.5
Science and Technology	11	3	9	1	1	0	21	4	16.0
Public Health	13	3	10	0	1	0	24	3	11.1
Industry	9	2	9	0	1	0	19	2	9.5
University Affairs	0	0	2	0	1	0	3	0	0.0
Auditor General	0	0	2	0	0	1	2	1	33.3
Total	201	30	226	15	22	1	447	46	9.3

administrative matters, Director-Generals and Deputy Director-Generals are categorized on a different scale than the standard ladder for general category civil servants which has been divided into eleven levels. The highest post (level 11) is at the Director-level. Therefore, it will be more appropriate to compare level 8 and above of civil servants in Japan with level 7 and above in Thailand. Female percentage of Director-General and Director, which are equivalent to level 9 and 10 of Thailand was 0.5% in 1980 and 0.75% in 1991. Despite the 0.25% increase over a decade, females among executive civil servants in Japan is roughly 1/10 of their counterparts in Thailand (table 11). While being the most economically developed country in this region, the situation on female civil servants in Japan made meagre progress after the United Nations Decade for

Table 11. Women's Participation in Senior Posts in the National Public Service (director level and higher) in Japan

Year	Director-General Level			Director Level		
	Total	Female	Ratio	Total	Female	Ratio
1980	1559	3	0.2	6459	39	0.6
1985	1623	2	0.1	6815	47	0.7
1990	1627	8	0.5	7316	61	0.8
1991	1571	5	0.3	7330	62	0.8

Source : National Personnel Authority

Note : Dire-Generals are at level 11 or designated professional level which is higher than level 11.

Women (1976-1985). The situation of women in the private sector in Japan has been similar to that of the public sector. According to the Basic survey on wage structure by the Ministry of Labour, female percentage among middle and low level managerial staff at the companies with more than 100 employees was 2.3% in 1981 and increased to 3.6% in 1992.

III. Factors hindering the advancement of women in civil service

1. Discrimination against women in recruitment and promotion

In 1984, 132,046 sat the examinations for a position under the jurisdiction of the Commission of Civil Service in Thailand, but only 3,370 of those who passed the exam were hired: (2,446 Level 1; 479 Level 2; 445 Level 3). The probability of success in the examination was, therefore, 2.6% average in the three levels, i. e. 2.8% in level 1; 1.7% in level 2 and 2.9% in level 3¹⁵. Graduates with a B.A. degree take the examination for level 3; graduates from commercial college or equivalent take the examination for level 2; high school or lower level school graduates take exams

for level 1.

Although no gender disaggregated data are available regarding the recruitment, more women have passed the examination and have remained at level 1,2 and 3 as explicitly shown in table 1. It is widely recognized among the people concerned that at the examination for civil servants, which is implemented only through paper tests, female candidates have often achieved better results and are more successful than male candidates¹⁶. Furthermore, female graduates from colleges and universities have outnumbered male graduates in Thailand as presented in table 3. It could be summarized that more competent and qualified women have taken the examination than men, resulting in higher female recruitment than male.

Regarding the specialist and administrative jobs at levels higher than level 3, each Ministry occasionally organizes and administers the examination for the positions. These examinations are frequently more competitive than the examinations for new recruitment : for instance, several hundred applicants per post are common. Such examinations include paper tests and interviews. According to the information informally collected from female civil servants, women have tended to be less successful in the interview, while they have demonstrated their competence in the paper tests¹⁷. Thus, more men have been recruited to such senior posts, enforcing one of the factors of the smaller number of female civil servants in senior posts in Thailand.

Data on promotion were not available either from the civil Service commission or from each Ministry, regardless of sex disaggregation. Therefore, an induction has been made based on the following indirect factors: .

A. Percentage increase of female civil servants at level 7 and above (approximately 7%) was larger than percentage increase of female civil servants among all civil servants (6%) during 1985 to 1992.

B. As mentioned before, (in the discussion relating to recruitment),

more women officers have been recruited to entry level posts than men, whilst more men have been recruited to middle management of higher level posts than women.

An induction from the above two factors is that the percentage of female officers who have been promoted to the higher levels of the ladder (level 7 and above in particular) increased more than that of male counterparts. This stimulative trend for female officers has been facilitated by the positive revision of laws and regulations that restricted women from becoming senior officials, such as assistant district chiefs, leading to the opportunity for promotion to district governor level. The resolution to prevent women from becoming an assistant district chief (level 8) was revised by the incumbent Chuan Cabinet in January 1993, in response to the growing women's right movements in Thailand. In March 1993, twelve female assistant district chiefs and one district governor were appointed. According to the 22 February 1994 issue of the "Nation" (an English-language newspaper in Thailand), 406 female officials were appointed as assistant district chiefs. This is a noteworthy achievement for the women's movement in this country, in particular for the advancement of women in public life.

2. Discrimination against women in training

In general, women have less opportunity in attending training courses for executives which increase managerial skills and knowledge necessary for professional career.

Training for civil servants in Thailand has been provided by individual Ministries, the Civil Service Training Institute, and National Institute of Development Administration. Other opportunities are training courses provided by foreign organizations such as donor agencies, such as high technology training courses provided by and in developed countries. Unfortunately, data on training provided by individual Ministries have not been available except on executive development programs of which

Table 13. Number and Percentage of Participants in Executive Development Programs in 1992 by Government Training Institute and Gender

Number	Ministry	Total	Female		Male	
			No.	%	No.	%
1	National Defense College, Ministry of Defense	180	13	7.2	167	92.8
2	Ministry of Finance	180	54	30.0	126	70.0
3	Ministry of Agriculture	70	35	50.0	35	50.0
4	Ministry of Public Health	221	92	41.6	58.4	
5	Civil Service Training Institute	101	18	17.8	83	82.2
6	Bangkok Metropolitan Administration	80	44	55.0	36	45.0
7	National Institute of Development Administration	57	16	28.1	41	71.9
Total		889	272	30.6	617	69.4

Source : Office of Civil Service Commission

data have been provided by Dr. Dhipavadee Meksawan as table 13.

a. The Civil Service Training Institute

The Civil Service Training Institute (CSTI) was officially established on 3 December 1980, to increase and improve the knowledge, skills and attitude of Thai civil servants and thus further develop their proficiency, productivity and effectiveness. Its staff comprises of 52 females and 22 males (as most staff of the Institute are in professional categories, such as trainers, more females have been recruited to the Institute). CSTI is designated by law to conduct and coordinate civil service development activities in the entire civil service system and is also assigned by the Cabinet to implement the National Development Policy for Civil Servants. Thus CSTI's responsibility encompasses all training activities of about 300,000 civil servants in Thailand.

Table 12. Training courses offered by the Civil Service Training Institute, Fiscal 1992

Title of the course	Participants		
	Female (%)	Male (%)	Total
Executive Development	22(19)	114(81)	136
Middle level administratot development	8(26)	23(74)	31
Supervisory training	20(53)	18(47)	38
Training development	96(69)	44(31)	140
Personnel management development	44(73)	16(27)	60
Orientation & special training	87(73)	32(29)	119
Total	277(53)	247(47)	524

Source : civil Service Training Institute

In general, the above table indicates a desirable situation for female officers in training as more females than males participated in training courses offered by CSTI. However, again, the above table shows an universal tendency : "while more female officers have attended introductory level training, more male officers have attended administration and executive level training". According to a female officer with CSTI, the Institute started, in late 1993, to collect information on training provided by each Ministry. It is envisaged that the results of the information collection will be available by the middle of 1994.

b. Training for executives

Table 13 is the result of Dr. Dhipavadee Meksawan's personal effort to obtain data on executive development programs from selected government organizations. It may be rational that the percentage of female attendants to programs offered by the National Defence College, Ministry of Defence was 7. 22. Female students have never been allowed to enter the College, unlike the National Defence Academy in Japan which started

to admit female students in 1993. However, the number of female participants in the programs offered by CSTI, National Institute of Development Administration should be increased. If there are not enough executive officers to participate in such training, female officers with lower ranks could be included in the participants in such training. If a tendency among female officers to refrain from attending such training programs is observed, appropriate guidance should be provided to those officers.

Although the sex disaggregated data on training of Japanese civil servants have not officially been available, the situation is shamefully behind that of their counterparts in Thailand. According to the personal experience of the author who has worked as a civil servant in Japan for over 20 years and has had opportunities to participate in and to be a lecturer at various training courses for managerial (both lower and middle) level civil servants, female participants at such courses numbered only several percents at maximum, if there were any all.

IV. Appropriate measures that could be taken for the advancement of women in civil service

Unlike the situation of female civil servants in Japan, where considerably fewer females have been recruited and provided with training opportunities, resulting in only a minimal number of women being promoted to the managerial level, in Thailand, although more women have been recruited and provided with training opportunities and scholarship to study abroad, females consist of about one fourth of the total managerial level officials and below 10% of senior executive officers. This phenomena could be attributed to strong social norms against women's participation in decision making in general, including public administration in Thailand. Some people who are concerned with women's issues also refer to women civil servants' unwillingness to

pursue their promotion. However, it is considered that if those social norms did exist, women would not anticipate any social and institutional obstacles or discriminations based on sex, and then they may more actively pursue their promotion.

In this connection, the efforts of the Women's Affairs Office of the Prime Minister's office which introduced gender training courses to government officers, at the senior level in particular, should be evaluated. It should also be emphasized that continuation and expansion of such gender training courses after appropriate evaluation of the courses should be essential to change the attitudes of both male and female civil servants.

Furthermore, the following measures could be effective to advance the status of women in civil service in Thailand (These measures may be applicable to other countries too).

1. In-depth study to identify the factors that hinder the promotion of women

Comparison of profiles among successful female civil servants, ordinary female civil servants and successful male civil servants could assist in finding out crucial factors to promote women as civil servants. Profiles should include the relationship with her/his supervisors and influential figures, marital status, family backgrounds and other possible elements, besides general elements for promotion, such as, educational background, experience of training, performance evaluation, of service. In formal evaluation from colleagues/subordinates of the opposite and same sex could provide some indicative factors. Other relevant studies should be undertaken.

2. Provision of child care leave for both parents

Thailand revised a regulation dealing with maternity leave for civil servants by increasing the leave from 60 days to 90 days in 1992. However, this revision is controversial for some feminist groups, who

Table 3. Number of Graduates, Academic Year 1992 (undergraduate and graduate)

Fields of Education	Lower than associate degree				Associate degree				B. A.				Graduate diploma				Total				
	Male		% F		Male		% F		Male		% F		Male		% F						
	Female	Total	Female	Total	Female	Total	Female	Total	Female	Total	Female	Total	Female	Total	Female	Total					
Whole	444	711	61.6	1155	759	398	34.4	1157	23671	27840	54.0	51511	533	395	42.6	928	25407	29344	53.6	54751	
1. Education	80	146.0	64.6	226		2	100.0		2	3607	5026	58.2	8633		11	100.0	11	3687	5185	58.4	8872
2. Humanity										384	2573	87.0	2957	9	28	75.7	37	393	2601	86.9	2994
3. Fine Arts					13	11	45.8	24	301	225	42.8	526						314	236	42.9	550
4. Law	11	17	60.7	28					4005	1076	21.2	5081	24	18	42.9	42	4040	1111	21.6	5151	
5. Social Science	3	8	72.7	11	14	78	84.8	92	7335	13119	64.1	20454	47	83	63.8	130	7399	13288	64.2	20687	
5.1 Social Science and Behavioral Science	1	5	83.3	6					3569	3422	48.9	6991	24	23	48.9	47	3594	3450	49.0	7044	
5.2 Business Administration	1		0.0	1	14	78	84.8	92	3260	8385	72.0	11645	23	60	72.3	83	3298	8523	72.1	11821	
5.3 Mass Communication	1	3	75.0	4					494	805	62.0	1299					495	808	62.0	1303	
5.4 Home Economics									12	507	97.7	519					12	507	97.7	519	
6. Natural Science					17	21	55.3	38	1310	1337	50.5	2647	1	1	50.0	2	1328	1359	50.6	2687	
6.1 Natural Science					17	21	55.3	38	786	775	49.6	1561					803	796	49.8	1599	
6.2 Mathematics and Computer									524	562	51.7	1086	1	1	50.0	2	525	563	51.7	1088	
7. Medical Science and Health Areas	57	523	90.2	580	139	224	61.7	363	2052	3348	62.0	5400	445	253	36.2	698	2693	4348	61.8	7041	
8. Engineering	293	17	5.5	310	529	26	4.7	555	3063	236	7.2	3299	7	1	12.5	8	3892	280	6.7	4172	
8.1 Engineering	293	17	5.5	310	510	18	3.4	528	2924	183	5.9	3107	7	1	12.5	8	3734	219	5.5	3953	
8.2 Architecture and City Planning					19	8	29.6	27	139	53	27.6	192					158	61	27.9	219	
9. Agriculture					47	36	43.4	83	1571	877	35.8	2448					1618	913	36.1	2531	
10. Others									43	23	34.8	66					43	23	34.8	66	

Source : Ministry of University Affairs, Thailand

Table 3a. Number of graduates, academic year 1992 (post-graduate)

Fields of Education	M. A.				Ph. D.				Total			
	Male	Female	% F	Total	Male	Female	% F	Total	Male	Female	% F	Total
Whole	2455	2380	49.2	4835	36	32	47.1	68	2491	2412	49.2	4903
1. Education	721	613	45.9	1334	9	9	50.0	18	730	622	46.0	1352
2. Humanity	29	77	72.6	106	2	2	50.0	4	31	79	71.8	110
3. Fine Arts	8		0	8					8	0	0.0	8
4. Law	57	31	35.2	88					57	31	35.2	88
5. Social Science	934	906	49.2	1840	4	4	50.0	8	938	910	49.2	1848
5.1 Social Science and Behavioral Science	275	276	50.0	551	1	3	75.0	4	276	279	50.3	555
5.2 Business Administration	638	517	44.7	1155	3	1	25.0	4	641	518	44.7	1159
5.3 Mass Communication	21	102	82.9	123					21	102	82.9	123
5.4 Home Economics		11	100	11					0	11	100.0	11
6. Natural Science	126	180	58.8	306	3	9	75.0	12	129	189	59.4	318
6.1 Natural Science	73	118	61.7	191	3	9	75.0	12	76	127	62.6	203
6.2 Mathematics and Computer	53	62	53.9	115					53	62	53.9	115
7. Medical Science and Health Areas	122	343	73.7	465	7	4	36.4	11	129	347	72.9	476
8. Engineering	214	43	16.7	257					214	43	16.7	257
8.1 Engineering	192	29	13.1	221					192	29	13.1	221
8.2 Architecture and City Planning	22	14	38.8	36					22	14	38.9	36
9. Agriculture	196	115	36.9	311	11	4	26.7	15	207	119	36.5	326
10. Others	48	72	60	120					48	72	60.0	120

strongly believe equality is essential to the establishment of a non-patriarchal society. They insist that the period of maternity leave should be equivalent to about the period of mother's recovery from confinement. In this regard, 60 days could be enough. Following the maternity leave, child care leave should be provided to both parents as both mother and father should be responsible for child-rearing. Otherwise, child rearing responsibility will be left to the mother alone and allow the father to escape from child-rearing duties. Furthermore, extension of maternity leave discourages employers from recruiting females¹⁸.

Table 4. Students by field of study (University-undergraduate courses)

Fields of Education	1980				1985				1992			
	Male	Female	%F	Total	Male	Female	%F	Total	Male	Female	%F	Total
Humanities	9974	14061	58.4	23990	100117	146733	59.4	246850	111364	220215	66.4	331579
Social Science	647251	57486	8.2	704737	608561	62440	9.3	671001	700395	147906	17.4	848301
Science	45900	8679	15.9	54579	48890	10788	18.1	59678	58650	14450	19.8	73100
Engineering	332602	5165	1.5	337767	334215	9375	2.7	343590	393203	22766	5.5	415960
Agriculture	52699	6859	11.5	59558	51240	8828	14.7	60068	50976	18712	26.9	69688
Health	77257	34801	31.1	112058	78430	39379	33.4	117809	69164	47834	40.9	116998
Mercantile Marine	1590	5	0.3	1595	1486	62	4.0	1548	1098	57	4.9	1155
Home Economics	215	31715	99.3	31930	247	31938	99.2	32185	640	37927	98.3	38567
Educational												
Teacher Training	62592	70619	53.0	133211	65217	70010	51.8	135227	64895	78703	54.8	143598
Arts	16427	27731	62.8	44158	16195	28695	63.9	44890	17228	34647	66.8	51875
Others	15107	6814	31.1	21921	15410	6136	28.5	21546	13139	356	36883	
Total	1351614	389935	22.4	1741504	1320008	414384	23.9	1734392	1491357	636356	29.9	2127704

Source : Ministry of Education, Japan

Table 5. Government Officials Studying Abroad Classified by Gender, Field of Study and Educational Level in September 1993

Field of Study	Total			Doctor			Master			
	Female	Male	%F	Female	Male	%F	Female	Male	%F	
Agriculture	215	100	115	46.5	58	78	42.7	42	37	53.2
Architecture	11	6	5	54.6	3	3	50.0	3	2	60.0
Biological Science	177	104	73	58.8	75	50	60.0	29	23	55.8
Business Administration	72	44	28	61.1	17	9	65.4	27	19	58.7
Chemistry	67	44	23	65.7	34	15	69.4	10	8	55.6
Computer Science	61	30	31	49.2	5	8	38.5	25	23	52.1
Economics	101	50	51	49.5	20	33	37.7	29	18	61.7
Education	195	103	92	52.8	61	53	53.5	42	39	51.9
Engineering	194	41	153	21.1	21	76	21.7	20	76	20.8
Food Science	37	25	12	67.6	14	7	66.7	11	5	68.8
Language and Literature	85	65	20	76.5	29	2	93.6	36	18	66.7
Law	51	16	35	31.4	9	13	40.9	7	22	24.1
Mass Communication	5	4	1	80.0	2	1	66.7	2	0	100.0
Mathematics	17	9	8	52.9	1	5	16.7	8	3	72.7
Medicine & Health Science	265	165	100	62.3	72	41	63.7	93	59	61.2
Pharmacy	37	27	10	73.0	19	9	67.9	8	1	88.9
Physics	41	13	28	31.7	10	18	35.7	3	9	25.0
Political Science	27	10	17	37.0	3	9	25.0	7	8	46.7
Psychology	7	4	3	57.1	1	2	33.3	3	1	75.0
Public Administration	52	41	11	78.9	4	4	50.0	37	7	84.1
Social Science	312	205	107	65.7	59	25	70.2	146	82	64.0
Total	2029	1106	923	54.5	517	461	52.9	588	460	56.1

Source : Office of the Civil Service Commission, Education and Training Abroad Division

3. Salary increase

Salary increase for civil servants may encourage more competent men to enter civil service, possibly resulting in fewer chances for women to be recruited to the sector. However, fair competition among both sexes facilitates an increase in women's competence in the long-term perspective. Therefore, civil servants' salary scales in Thailand should

be revised more frequently so that Thai civil servants can properly deal and compete with the increasing consumer price index in Thailand, thereby maintaining better quality of life. A more pertinent salary would also reduce corruption, which has perpetuated in both politics and the civil service in Thailand.

4. Recruitment of female managers from the private sector, in particular from service industries

Among the private sector, service industries have successfully achieved better utilization of women power in managerial and executive levels. Public sector workers, particularly, civil servants have to service people. In this regard, civil servants should consider themselves as service sector workers. Recruiting female managers from private service industries to changing civil servants to public officers servicing people.

REFERENCES :

1. Yearbook of labour Statistics, 1991, Dept. of Labour, Ministry of Interior, 1992.
2. Government employees comprised 5.8% of total labour force in 1974 and 7.1% in 1983.
3. Government employees comprised about 25% of total employees in the country in early 1980's and decreased to 22.3% in 1988 and further decreased to 17.9% in 1991.
4. Yearbook of Labour Statistics.
5. Promotion of decentralization was one of eight primary issues in the final recommendations prepared by the Ad-hoc Committee to Promote Public Administration Revolution of Japan, in October 1993.
6. National Personnel Authority : Survey on civil servants working for national governments in Japan

7. Proserpina Pumingos Tapales, Women in politics and public administration ; the case of Philippines *Asian review of Public Administration* Jan. / June 1992, vol. iv, no.1
8. For instance, education statistics in Thailand have never provided sex disaggregated data. Consequently, few data on Thailand in *UNESCO statistical yearbook* are sex disaggregated.
9. Reengineering the civil service. prepared by the office of the Civil Service Commission of the Thailand, presented to the 7th ASEAN Conference on Civil Service Matters, 4-8 October 1993, Malaysia
10. Suteera Thomson and others. "Human resources management in the public sector" in *A concept paper : the role of Thai Women in development*, 1988. pp. 46-49
11. Japan introduced and enforced Equal Employment Opportunity Law in order to ratify UN Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women without reservation in 1985. Despite various criticism on the law from feminists and union workers, regarding the lack of enforcement power to punish the companies and other organizations and individuals which (or who) do not follow the law, nobody can deny that the law has facilitated the promotion of the status of women in both private and public sectors.
12. Teaching staff at Universities and Colleges, such as professors and associate professors are posted at level 11/10 or as professors and associate professors are posted at level 11/10 or 9/8 respectively, resulting in that the percentage of level 7 and upper at the Ministry of University Affairs is disproportionally higher than others. Similarly, as teachers of under the jurisdiction of the Ministry Education, who comprise more than 60% of total civil servants in 1985, are usually posted lower level than 7, the figures of Ministry of Education was also excluded from the calculation, in view of relevant comparison.
13. National Commission on the Role of Filipino Women, *The Philippine country report on women, 1986-1995*, mimeograph. 1993
14. Sex disaggregated data before 1985 are available but incomparable with the data after 1985 as a different scale for civil servant had been used before 1985.
15. Public sector employment in Thailand : civil service an state enterprise. by Peter Block, Sirilaxana Chitikul and Nipon Poapongsakorn, A background

paper prepared for the World Bank Economic Report on Thailand in February 1986.

16. S. Thomson, *ibid.*

17. Thomson. *ibid.*

18. The author has informally heard a complaint about the extension of maternity leave from an executive of a Japanese invested company. Those companies might reduce the number of young female employees if the Government revises the regulation to increase maternity leave for the private sector.